

Israeli Territorial Politics: Between Security & Identity
HBRJD-UA 712, Spring 2013 (*syllabus ver. 2*)
MW 3:30-4:45 pm, 01/28/2013 - 05/13/2013
KJCC BSMT

Instructor: Ariel Zellman, azellman@nyu.edu
Taub Center for Israel Studies, 14 Washington Mews, 2nd Floor, Room 202
Office Hours: TTh 2:00-3:00pm or by appointment

Perhaps the most familiar trope in the Israeli-Palestinian conflict is Israel's insistence on "secure and recognized borders" in any final settlement. Although a consistent theme of Zionist politics and diplomacy even before the founding of the State of Israel, there has always been an internal debate as to which borders would provide Israel with security and which boundaries must ultimately be recognized by the Arab world. Often overshadowed in the international arena but no less important in Israeli domestic discourse is the relationship between Israeli national identity and the Land of Israel. This course will explore the evolution of and conflict between these two concepts in Israeli domestic discourse and their respective impact on Israel's territorial policies and international boundaries. After considering the role of security and identity in shaping broad domestic understandings of territory in Israel, we will examine how these concepts have uniquely influenced Israeli compromise or lack thereof in the Sinai Peninsula, Southern Lebanon, the Gaza Strip, the Golan Heights, Jerusalem, and the West Bank. To accomplish this goal, this course will incorporate a range of scholarly historical and political readings on Israel as well as films and regular student-led discussions on relevant current events.

Course requirements:

- In-class presentation (15%)
- Current events analysis (2 x 10%)
- Attendance & Participation (10%)
- Term Paper (55%)
 - Paper Proposal (5%)
 - Paper Outline (10%)
 - Final paper (40%)

Required texts:

- Online Reading Packet, see course website

Useful but not required texts:

- Netanel Lorch, ed, *Major Knesset Debates 1948-1981*, vols 1-6, United Press of America, Jerusalem Center for Public Affairs: Lanham, MD; Jerusalem, 1993. *Free pdfs for all volumes available here:* <http://jcpa.org/article/major-knesset-debates-1948-1981/>
- Walter Laqueur and Barry Rubin, eds., *The Israeli-Arab Reader: A Documentary History of the Middle East Conflict*, 7th ed., Penguin Books: New York, 2008.
- Benny Morris, *Righteous Victims: A History of the Zionist Arab Conflict, 1881-2001*, Vintage Books: New York, 2001.
- Nadav Shelef, *Evolving Nationalism: Homeland, Identity, and Religion in Israel, 1925-2005*, Cornell University Press: Ithaca, NY, 2010.

In-Class Presentations:

Beginning in the second week of classes, one or two students will each lead a brief, 10-15 minute in-class discussion regarding a current issue in Israeli politics related to that day's assigned readings. Near the end of class, Each student will speak for no more than 5 minutes regarding their chosen topic and then offer 3 questions for general discussion. Discussions should draw from *at least* two newspaper articles that present contrasting views of the issue under examination as well as from the week's readings. Topics must be chosen at least one week in advance with approval of the instructor, and articles and discussion questions will be emailed to the entire class *no less than 24 hours before class*. Presentations will be scheduled during the first week of classes.

Current Events Analysis:

Students are expected to submit **two** 2-3 page, double-spaced analyses of a current issue in Israeli politics. Like the in-class presentations, analyses should be based on at least two newspaper articles that present contrasting views of the issue as well as the day's readings. Articles should be submitted to the instructor along with the analysis. Students may submit analyses for *any* day they choose so long as they are submitted on two different days and not on the same day as your own in-class presentation.

Attendance & Participation:

Regular attendance of and participation in class discussions is essential to your success in this course. Absences for campus activities, religious observances, personal concerns, etc must be cleared with the instructor in advance barring emergencies so appropriate make-up work can be assigned. Classroom discussions will be open, civil, and mutually respectful. Active involvement in class discussion is strongly preferred, however if you feel very uncomfortable speaking in front of your peers, the instructor can offer alternative assignments for participation credit.

Term Paper:

A significant portion of your grade for this course is tied to the term paper. In it, you are required to critically analyze and evaluate some aspect of Israeli territorial politics discussed in this course. Papers are encouraged to explore the course's central theme of security and identity, applying these concepts to one or more cases of contentious territorial claims in the history of modern Israel. In doing so, your paper should elucidate how these themes have impacted (or perhaps failed to impact) Israeli popular opinion, state policy, conduct in international warfare and negotiations, or the like. Students may choose to focus their papers on a particular time period, disputed space, political ideology, or sector of the Israeli population. Papers may offer policy recommendations regarding their subject although are not required to do so.

In order to assist students in developing the best possible paper and facilitate its timely completion, three benchmark due dates have been scheduled for the submission of a paper proposal, paper outline, and final paper for classes 13, 20, and 28. The **paper proposal** need be no longer than 1-1.5 pages double-spaced with a clearly stated topic, thesis question, and provisional argument. It should also include a basic description of potential sources of information and evidence to test your hypothesis. The **paper outline** should be approximately 5 pages double-spaced with greater detail as to the kinds of arguments and data you will be using to support your arguments. This should be a basic roadmap to your paper. These are as much

opportunities for critical feedback on your work by the instructor as they are tasks to keep you on schedule. *You are encouraged to make the most of them.* Final papers should be no longer than 20 pages excluding bibliographic references, double-spaced, and use 12 point font and 1 inch margins. They are due at the beginning of the final day of class.

Unit A: Zionism, The Jewish State, and the Land of Israel

Monday, January 28, Class 1: Introduction

General introduction to course content and expectations

Assignment of in-class presentations

Questions

Israeli Elections 2013

Wednesday, January 30, Class 2: General Concepts

Ben Halperin, "4: Attachment to Zion" in *The Idea of the Jewish State*, 1969, pgs. 95-130.

Gideon Biger, "The Boundaries of Israel--Palestine Past, Present, and Future: A Critical Geographical View," *Israel Studies* 13, no. 1 (Spring 2008) pgs. 68-93.

Benedict Anderson, "10: Census, Map, Museum" in *Imagined Communities: Reflections on the Origins and Spread of Nationalism*, Verso: London, 1991 (revised edition), pgs. 163-185.

Monday, February 4, Class 3: Labor Zionism

Nadav Shelef, "Chapter 1: Labor Zionist Mapping of the Homeland" in *Evolving Nationalism*, 2010, pgs. 25-49.

Shlomo Avineri, "Chapter 17: Ben Gurion: the Vision and the Power," in *The Making of Modern Zionism: The Intellectual Origins of the Jewish State*, 1981, pgs. 198-216.

Wednesday, February 6, Class 4: Revisionist Zionism

Nadav Shelef, "Chapter 3: Revisionist Zionist Mapping of the Homeland," in *Evolving Nationalism*, 2010, pgs. 81-106.

Shlomo Avineri, "Chapter 15: Jabotinsky: Integral Nationalism and the Illusion of Power," in *The Making of Modern Zionism: The Intellectual Origins of the Jewish State*, 1981, pgs. 159-186.

Anthony Smith, "Chapter 2: Basic themes of ethno-symbolism," in *Ethnosymbolism and Nationalism: A cultural approach*, Routledge: London, 2009, pgs. 23-40.

Monday, February 11, Class 5: Religious Zionism

Nadav Shelef, "Chapter 2: Religious Zionist Mapping of the Homeland," in *Evolving Nationalism*, 2010, pgs. 50-80.

Shlomo Avineri, "Chapter 16: Rabbi Kook: the Dialectics of Redemption," in *The Making of Modern Zionism: The Intellectual Origins of the Jewish State*, 1981, pgs. 187-197.

Wednesday, February 13, Class 6: Demography and Demographic Threats?

Matt Evans, "Defending Territorial Sovereignty Through Civilian Settlement: The Case of Israel's Population Dispersal Policy," *Israel Affairs*, 12, no. 3 (July 2006), pgs. 578-96.

Monica Duffy Toft, "Demography and National Security: The Politics of Population Shifts in Contemporary Israel," *International Area Studies Review* 15, no. 1 (March 2012), pgs. 21-42.

Monday, February 18, Presidents' Day: NO CLASS

Unit B: Sinai Peninsula & Peace with Egypt

Wednesday, February 20, Class 7: 1956 Suez Crisis & 1967 Six Day War

Benny Morris, "Six: 1949-1956" & "Seven: The Six-Day War, 1967" in *Righteous Victims*, 2001, pgs. 259-346.

Michael Oren, "The Test of Suez: Israel and the Middle East Crisis of 1958," *Studies in Zionism*, 12, no. 1 (1991), pgs. 55-83.

"With Mixed Feelings," Interview in *The Seventh Day: Soldiers' Talk about the Six-Day War*, 1970, pgs. 115-119.

Monday, February 25, Class 8: War of Attrition and 1973 Yom Kippur War

Benny Morris, "Eight: The War of Attrition" & "Nine: The October War, 1973" in *Righteous Victims*, 2001, pgs. 347-443.

Charles Lieberman, "The Myth of Defeat: The Memory of the Yom Kippur War in Israeli Society," *Middle East Studies*, 29, no. 3 (1993), pgs. 399-418.

Tirza Hechter, "Historical Traumas, Ideological Conflicts, and the Process of Mythologizing," *International Journal of Middle East Studies*, 35, no. 3 (August 2003), pgs. 439-460.

Wednesday, February 27, Class 9: Peace Negotiations, Uprooting Settlements, Withdrawal

Benny Morris, "Ten: The Israeli-Egyptian Peace, 1977-79," in *Righteous Victims*, 2001, pgs. 444-493.

Michael Feige, "10: The Trauma that Never War: The Evacuation of Sinai" in *Settling in the Hearts: Jewish Fundamentalism in the Occupied Territories*, 2008, pgs. 196-211.

Gabriel Sheffer, "Was it Really a Trauma? Wider Political Implications of the Removal of Israeli Settlements from the Sinai," *Journal of Applied Behavioral Science*, 23, no. 1 (1987), pgs. 117-129.

Unit C: Southern Lebanon

Monday, March 4, Class 10: PLO in Lebanon and 1st Lebanon War

Benny Morris, "Eleven: The Lebanon War, 1982-85," in *Righteous Victims*, 2001, pgs. 494-560.

Ze'ev Schiff, "Lebanon: Motivations and Interests in Israel's Policy," *The Middle East Journal* 38, no. 2 (Spring 1984), pgs. 220-227.

Asher Arian, "Israeli Public Opinion and the War in Lebanon," *JCSS Memorandum No. 15* (October 1985), Jaffee Center for Strategic Studies.

Wednesday, March 6, Class 11: Security Zone and Withdrawal

Benny Morris, "Fourteen: Ehud Barak's 19 Months," in *Righteous Victims*, 2001, pgs. 654-658.

Avraham Sela, "Civil Society, the Military, and National Security: The Case of Israel's Security Zone in South Lebanon." *Israel Studies* 12, no. 1 (2007): 53-78.

Daniel Lieberfeld, "Parental Protest, Public Opinion, and War Termination: Israel's 'Four Mothers' Movement," *Social Movement Studies* 8, no. 4 (2009), pgs. 375-392.

Monday, March 11, Class 12: Second Lebanon War

Gil Merom, "The Second Lebanon War: Democratic Lessons Imperfectly Applied," *Democracy and Security*, 4, no. 1 (2008), pgs. 5-33.

Yagil Levy, "The Second Lebanon War: Coping with the 'Gap of Legitimacies' Syndrome," *Israel Studies Forum* 21, no. 1 (Summer 2009), pgs. 3-24.

Unit D: Gaza

Wednesday, March 13, Class 13: Gaza 1948-1982

Review: Previous chapters in Benny Morris, *Righteous Victims*.

Tom Segev, "1: The Green Line" in *1949: The First Israelis*, 1986, pgs. 3-42.

Gershom Gorenberg, "7: The Reign of Hubris" & "Epilogue: Ephemeral for the Fourth Decade," in *Accidental Empire: Israel and the Birth of the Settlements, 1967-1977*, 2006, pgs. 187-219 (esp. 212-219), 363-376.

"A Lousy Feeling," Interview in *The Seventh Day: Soldiers' Talk about the Six-Day War*, 1970, pgs. 120-122.

Paper Proposal Due in Class

March 18-22: Spring Recess

Monday, March 25, Class 14 (Passover Eve)

Film: *Waltz with Bashir* or *Beaufort*

Wednesday, March 27, Class 15 (Passover Second Day)

Film: *The Disengagement*

Monday, April 1, Class 16: Gaza: Intifada & Oslo (Passover Seventh Day)

Benny Morris, "Twelve: The Intifada" & "Thirteen: Peace at Last?" in *Righteous Victims*, 2001, pgs. 561-651. Also review "Fourteen: Ehud Barak's 19 Months" 652-675.

Joseph Alpher, "Israel's Security Concerns in the Peace Process," *International Affairs*, 70, no. 2 (April 1994), pgs. 229-241.

Amos Perlmutter, "Arafat's Police State," *Foreign Affairs* 73, no. 4 (Jul-Aug 1994), pgs. 8-11.

Wednesday, April 3, Class 17: Gaza Disengagement 2005

Motti Inbari, "Fundamentalism in Crisis--The Response of the Gush Emunim Rabbinical Authorities to the Theological Dilemmas Raised by Israel's Disengagement Plan," *Journal of Church & State*, 49 (2007), pgs. 697-717.

David Makovsky, "Gaza: Moving Forward by Pulling Back," *Foreign Affairs*, 84, no. 3 (May/June 2005), pgs. 52-62.

David Newman, "From Hitnachlut to Hitnatkut: The Impact of Gush Emunim and the Settlement Movement on Israeli Politics and Society," *Israel Studies*, 10, no. 3 (Fall 2005), pgs. 192-224.

Jonathan Rynhold and Dov Waxman, "Ideological Change and Israel's Disengagement from Gaza," *Political Science Quarterly*, 123, no. 1 (2008), pgs. 11-37.

Instructor will be at Conference over weekend

Unit E: Golan Heights

Monday, April 8, Class 18: Israel & Syria 1948-1967

Review: Morris, Righteous Victims, Chapter Six, pgs. 259-301

Moshe Shemesh, "Prelude to the Six-Day War: The Arab-Israeli Struggle Over Water Resources," *Israel Studies* 9, no. 3 (Fall 2004), pgs. 1-45.

Eyal Zisser, "June 1967: Israel's Capture of the Golan Heights," *Israel Studies* 7, no. 1 (Spring 2002), pgs. 168-194.

Wednesday, April 10, Class 19: Conquest and Settlement

Review: Morris, Righteous Victims, Chapters 7-9, 11 pgs. 302-443.

"The War was a Yardstick" & "Justice and Strength", Interviews in *The Seventh Day: Soldiers' Talk about the Six-Day War*, 1970, pgs. 107-14, 136-53.

Gershom Gorenberg, "3: Silent Cowboys on the New Frontier", "4: Settling In" & "9: Mere Anarchy is Loosed" in *Accidental Empire: Israel and the Birth of the Settlements, 1967-1977*, 2006, pgs.72-128, 250-279.

Monday, April 15, Class 20: Annexation and Negotiation

Review: Morris, Righteous Victims, Chapters 13-14.

Efraim Inbar, "Israeli Negotiations with Syria," *Israel Affairs* 1, no. 4 (1995), pgs. 89-100.

Ron E. Hassner, "The Path to Intractability: Time and the Entrenchment of Territorial Disputes." *International Security* 31, no. 3 (Winter 2006/07): 107-38.

Paper Outline Due in Class

Unit F: Jerusalem

Wednesday, April 17, Class 21: Divided City

Review: Morris, Righteous Victims, Chapters 6 & 7

Tom Segev, "Chapter 3: Maps and Dreams," in *1967: Israel, the War, and the Year that Transformed the Middle East*, 2007, pgs. 143-190.

Doron Bar, "Re-Creating Jewish Sanctity in Jerusalem: Mount Zion and David's Tomb, 1948–67." *Journal of Israeli History* 23, no. 2 (2004): 260-78.

Monday, April 22, Class 22: Reunited City

Review: Morris, Righteous Victims, Chapters 12-14.

Tom Segev, "Chapter 19: Teddy's Project," in *1967: Israel, the War, and the Year that Transformed the Middle East*, 2007, pgs. 482-499.

Klein, Menachem. "Jerusalem without East Jerusalem: The Palestinian as the "Other" in Jerusalem." *Journal of Israeli History* 23, no. 2 (2007): 174-99.

"Part 6: Jerusalem" in *The Seventh Day: Soldiers' Talk about the Six-Day War*, 1970, pgs. 227-44.

Wednesday, April 24, Class 23: Peace and Jerusalem

Jeremy Pressman, "Visions in Collision: What Happened at Camp David and Taba?". *International Security* 28, no. 2 (Fall 2003): 5-43.

Ron Hassner, "7: Successful Conflict Management: Jerusalem, 1967" in *War on Sacred Grounds*, 2009, pgs. 113-134.

"Indivisible Jerusalem - A Panorama View," Jerusalem Center for Public Affairs, online presentation and resource. <http://jerusalem.jcpa.org/>

Gadi Baltianski and Nidal Foqaha, "The Geneva Initiative: A Detailed Proposal for a Comprehensive Israeli-Palestinian Peace Agreement," (Tel Aviv, Ramallah: Geneva Initiative, 2009). Sections 4, 5, and 6, <http://www.geneva-accord.org/mainmenu/geneva-initiative-annexes>

Unit G: West Bank

Monday, April 29, Class 24: Film: The Hilltops

Wednesday, May 1, Class 25: Hebron and Gush Etzion

Review: Morris, Righteous Victims, Chapters 6 & 7

Jerold S. Auerbach, "3: Community" & "4: Catastrophe" in *Hebron Jews : Memory and Conflict in the Land of Israel*. Lanham, Md.: Rowman & Littlefield, 2009, pgs. 49-78.

David Ohana, "Kfar Etzion: The Community of Memory and the Myth of Return." *Israel Studies* 7, no. 2 (Summer 2002): 145-74.

Monday, May 6, Class 26: Post 1967 Conquest/Liberation and Settlement

Review: Morris, Righteous Victims, Chapters 12-14.

Arye Naor, "'Behold, Rachel, Behold': The Six Day War as a Biblical Experience and Its Impact on Israel's Political Mentality." *Journal of Israeli History* 24, no. 2 (2005): 229-50.

"Justice and Strength" & "People and Country", Interviews in *The Seventh Day: Soldiers' Talk about the Six-Day War*, 1970, pgs. 136-53, 159-78.

Michael Feige, "7: Jewish Hebron: Fathers, Sons, and Sacrifice" & "8: Gush Etzion and the Decline of Secular Zionist Mythology" in *Settling in the Hearts: Jewish Fundamentalism in the Occupied Territories*, 2008, p. 144-180.

Wednesday, May 8, Class 27: Between Frontier and Homeland

Efraim Inbar, "The Rise and Demise of the Two-State Paradigm," *Orbis* (Spring 2009), pgs. 265-283.

Amir Lupovici, "Ontological Dissonance, Clashing Identities, and Israel's Unilateral Steps Towards the Palestinians," *Review of International Studies*, 38, no. 4 (October 2012), pgs. 809-833.

Michael Feige, "13: Settling in the Hearts of the Nation: Gush Emunim in Times of Crisis" in *Settling in the Hearts: Jewish Fundamentalism in the Occupied Territories*, 2008, pgs. 247-282.

Monday, May 13, Class 28: Final Class

Closing Thoughts, Open discussion

*** Final Paper due in class ***